

1 Erica Sanchez, Of Counsel
2 Shefer Law Firm, P.A.
3 800 SE 4th. Ave #803
4 Hallandale Beach, Florida 33009
5 Telephone: (480) 866-1111
6 erica@shefer.legal
7 Arizona Bar #027107
8 Attorney for Respondent

9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
DISTRICT OF ARIZONA

Oscar Castaneda Rodriguez,
Petitioner,

v

Kristi Noem, et al,
Respondents.

Case No. 25-cv-04845-SHD

A 

PETITIONER'S REPLY TO
RESPONDENTS' RESPONSE TO
ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE

INTRODUCTION

Petitioner Oscar Castaneda Rodriguez files this reply to Respondents' Response to the Order to Show Cause regarding Petitioner's petition for habeas corpus [dkt. 7]. Respondents appear to concede that Petitioner is entitled to a bond hearing as a result of orders entered on 12/18/2025 in *Maldonado Bautista v. Santacruz*, Case No. 5:25-CV-01873-SSS-BFM, -- F.R.D. --, 2025 WL 3288403 (C.D. Cal. Nov. 25, 2025). Those orders were:

- (1) Order Granting In Part And Denying In Part Petitioners' Ex Parte Application For Reconsideration Or Clarification [dkt. no. 92] (Clarification Order);
- (2) Amended Order Consolidating The Court's Orders On Motion For Partial Summary Judgment, Class Certification, And Application For Reconsideration Or Clarification [dkt. no. 93] (Consolidation Order); and
- (3) Final Judgment [dkt. no. 94] (Final Order).

1
2 Although Respondents filed a Notice Of Appeal to the Ninth Circuit Court of
3 Appeals of all three orders on 12/18/2025 [dkt. no. 95], no Motion for Stay has yet been
4 requested in either the Central District of California or the 9th Circuit Court of Appeals. "A
5 party must ordinarily move first in the district court for a stay of the judgment or order of a
6 district court pending appeal." Fed.R.App.Pro. 8(a)(1).
7

8 Accordingly, the following holdings of the Clarification Order are currently valid:
9

10 . . . Although the MSJ Order does not grant vacatur of *Yajure*
11 *Hurtado* under the APA, **Yajure Hurtado is no longer controlling;**
12 **the legal conclusion underlying the decision is no longer**
13 **tenable.**

14 Because vacatur is a necessary consequence of declaring an
15 agency action unlawful, vacatur of the DHS Policy¹ is within the
16 scope of the MSJ Order. Detailed reasoning and discussion of
17 potential jurisdictional issues are discussed in the Amended
18 Consolidated Order to be issued shortly after this Order. Accordingly,
19 the Court GRANTS Petitioners' Application to clarify that the MSJ
20 Order encompassed Count III of the Amended Class Complaint and
21 **granted classwide vacatur of the unlawful DHS policy.**

22 Clarification Order at page 6 (emphasis added).
23

24 Thus, although Petitioner does not concede his membership in the Bond Eligible
25 Class certified in *Maldonado Bautista* at this juncture, the holdings in the Certification
26 Order certainly support granting him habeas relief. Obviously, he filed this habeas
27 petition to pursue his individual remedies.
28

1 Previously defined in the 11/20/2025 Order Granting Petitioners' Motion For Partial Summary Judgment And Denying Request To Enter Final Judgment [dkt. no. 81] as "July 8, 2025...Department of Homeland Security (DHS) instituted a notice titled 'Interim Guidance Regarding Detention Authority for Applicants for Admission' ['DHS Guidance Notice' or 'DHS Policy']".

1 Although Respondents did not address *Echevarria v. Bondi, et al.*, No. 2:25-cv-
2 03252-PHX-DWL, 2025 WL 2821282 (D. Ariz. Oct. 3, 2025), *Maldonado Bautista* is
3 consistent with the holdings in *Echevarria*.

4 **CONCLUSION**

5
6 Petitioner Oscar Castaneda Rodriguez requests the Court grant his petition for
7 habeas and require Respondents to immediately release him or, in the alternative,
8 schedule him for a bond hearing within seven (7) days under 8 U.S.C. § 1226, without
9 regard to the holding of *Matter of Yajure Hurtado*, 29 I&N Dec. 216 (B.I.A. 2025).

10
11 Dated: December 31, 2025, 2025

Attorney for Respondent

12 By: /s/ Erica Sanchez
13 Erica Sanchez, Of Counsel
14 Shefer Law Firm, P.A.
15 800 SE 4th. Ave #803
16 Hallandale Beach, Florida 33009
17 Telephone: (480) 866-1111
18 erica@shefer.legal
19 Arizona Bar #027107
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28