

1 BILAL A. ESSAYLI  
United States Attorney  
2 DAVID M. HARRIS  
Assistant United States Attorney  
3 Chief, Civil Division  
JOANNE S. OSINOFF  
4 Assistant United States Attorney  
Chief, Complex and Defensive Litigation Section  
5 RYAN C. CHAPMAN (Cal. Bar No. 318595)  
Assistant United States Attorney  
6 Federal Building, Suite 7516  
300 North Los Angeles Street  
7 Los Angeles, California 90012  
Telephone: (213) 894-2471  
8 Facsimile: (213) 894-7819  
E-mail: Ryan.Chapman@usdoj.gov

9 Attorneys for Respondents

10 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
11 FOR THE CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

12 Rosalina LUNA,

13 Petitioner,

14 v.

15 Kristi NOEM, Secretary, Department of  
16 Homeland Security; et al.,

17 Respondents.  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

No. 2:25-cv-05923-JFW-GJS

**RESPONDENTS' OBJECTION TO  
PLAINTIFF'S NOTICE OF RELATED  
CASES [ECF No. 2]**

1 Pursuant to Local Rule 83-1.3.3, Respondents respectfully file this objection to  
2 Plaintiff's Notice of Related Cases (the "Notice"), ECF No. 2.

3 Plaintiff's Notice claims that this case is related to *Vasquez Perdomo v. Noem*,  
4 2:25-cv-05605-MEMF-SP, because "[b]oth cases involve the arrest of individuals  
5 without probable cause or a warrant by Immigration and Customs Enforcement" and  
6 they "raise identical issues in their claims." ECF No. 2 at 2. However, these cases  
7 involve different petitioners in different factual circumstances. Even assuming that the  
8 questions of law were exactly the same, that would be insufficient to treat the cases as  
9 related. For example, employment discrimination cases alleging race discrimination  
10 brought by the same counsel against the same government agency but involving different  
11 plaintiffs and agency employees do not constitute related cases that are assigned to the  
12 same judge. Were the rule otherwise, there would be no end to cases being low-  
13 numbered repeatedly to the same judge by attorneys bringing different claims based on  
14 the same legal theory. Petitioner's Notice is insufficient to treat the cases as related  
15 without transforming all habeas petitions into related cases.

16  
17 Dated: July 1, 2025

BILAL A. ESSAYLI  
United States Attorney  
DAVID M. HARRIS  
Assistant United States Attorney  
Chief, Civil Division  
JOANNE S. OSINOFF  
Assistant United States Attorney  
Chief, Complex and Defensive Litigation Section

22 /s/Ryan C. Chapman  
23 RYAN C. CHAPMAN  
Assistant United States Attorney

24 Attorneys for Respondents  
25  
26  
27  
28